

Report of the Chief Executive

HS2 UPDATE1. Purpose of report

To update the Committee on the published HS2 Working Draft Environmental Statement and to consider a response to this consultation.

2. Background

In July 2017, following refinements, the Secretary of State for Transport published the West Midlands to Leeds section of the HS2 Phase 2b route.

HS2 has produced a Working Draft Environmental Statement (WDES) which seeks to identify the likely significant environmental effects likely to be caused by the construction and operation of the HS2 railway along the proposed route and proposes mitigation to reduce or minimise the effects. HS2 are currently seeking views on the WDES, the consultation closes 21 December 2018.

Responses to this consultation will inform on-going design and environmental assessment in advance of the formal Environmental Statement which is needed to accompany the deposit of the hybrid Bill.

HS2 will bring substantial economic and social opportunities to Broxtowe and with the creation of new jobs and investment. However, it is important that any adverse impacts are kept to a minimum. With this in mind there are a number of specific issues that should be raised in response to the consultation. These are detailed further in this report but include: the demolition of the Greenwood Community Centre in Toton, the design of the Hub Station at Toton, including car parking and provision for a tram extension.

In addition, the lack of section plans made it difficult to engage.

3. Details

These are in the appendix.

4. Financial implications

The cost to Broxtowe can be met within existing budgets.

Recommendation

The Committee is asked to RESOLVE to respond to the consultation with the points contained in this report.

Background papers

Nil

APPENDIX

For Broxtowe the WDES identifies the following significant effects:

Permanent effects:

- Demolition of the Greenwood Community Centre on Chester Green Toton;
- Demolition of the Midland Hotel in Stapleford;
- Demolition of the West End public house in Stapleford;
- Closure of the Toton Sidings Local Wildlife Site;
- Loss of residential properties on Bessell Lane Stapleford;
- Loss of residential properties on the B600 Nottingham Road in Nuthall;
- Demolition of the Nottinghamshire Police Motorway Patrol Unit in Trowell;
- Demolition of the CARE fertility clinic in Strelley; and
- Loss of land within New Farm Wood in Nuthall.

Temporary effects on:

- Toton Fields Local Nature Reserve;
- The playing field associated with the Nuthall Parish Council Temple Centre; and
- New Farm Wood in Nuthall.

In response to the Phase 2b route announcement (prior to the publication of the WDES) a consortium of East Midlands Councils (including Broxtowe) commissioned SNC-Lavalin to independently review the proposed route to examine the potential to reduce or remove the adverse impact of the route on residential and commercial properties at a number of specified locations (for Broxtowe these were Trowell, Strelley and Nuthall). The Lavalin Report (see appendix 1) considers scope for mitigation of property and environmental impacts (including route alignments and different options) and makes recommendations. A summary of findings for the specified locations in Broxtowe are included below (and cross-referenced with information in the WDES).

Trowell (Stanton Gate Viaduct): The presence of the HS2 alignment and supporting viaduct (LA06 Map Book CT-06-435b & CT-06-436) will have a significant impact. The impacts associated with the construction of the route and its supporting viaduct should be largely mitigated. Similarly, the viaduct may be engineered to minimise obstructions to the usage of existing leisure facilities by the positioning and choice of appropriate intermediate supports. However, the mitigation of the visual impact will depend on the careful design to achieve an acceptable appearance of the viaduct and its intermediate supports. The suggestion of the adoption of a tunnel or embankment in place of the viaduct would be hard to justify due to the significantly greater cost of either option.

Unfortunately, no section plans or further details of the viaduct were included in the HS2 consultation documentation and so mitigation for visual impact will remain an outstanding issue which will need to be resolved through careful design.

Strelley and Nuthall: The HS2 route passes through Strelley via a new tunnel (LA06 Map Book CT-06-438). The latest information from HS2 indicates that this will be a bored tunnel, which will minimise construction impacts on the village compared to other options. With respect to the permanent impacts the route would introduce visual and noise impacts that would require local mitigation.

At Nuthall the HS2 route passes immediately adjacent to and at the same level as the M1 motorway. There will be incremental visual and noise impacts that will require local mitigation.

Other key issues as a result of the detail contained within the WDES are expanded on below.

Design of the East Midlands Hub Station:
Parking provision

The WDES makes provision for a 4,000 space surface car park to the west and east of the station.

Policy 3.2 of the Part 2 Local Plan (as submitted for Examination) requires *“private vehicle access to the station to be provided via the A52, terminating in ideally underground parking or failing this a multi-storey car park to serve station”*. The station car parking as shown on the plan provided by HS2 (LA05 Map Book CT-06-433) is surface level and as a result has a much larger land-take than envisaged. The area to the west of the station is envisaged to form an area of large scale employment development and it is not considered to be an efficient use of land for this high value, sustainable location to be developed for car-parking.

Tram Extension: The WDES makes an allowance for a corridor for a future extension of the Tram on the east of the Station.

Policy 3.2 of the Part 2 Local Plan (as submitted for Examination) requires a *‘tram extension to the HS2 Station which should be high level access and complete prior to the opening of the station. It should be designed in such a way as to allow for its potential expansion to Long Easton, Derby and East Midlands Airport. This will need to include a bridge over the station of sufficient size to accommodate different modes of transport which in addition to the tram would be bus, car, cycle and pedestrian’*. It is unclear from the plans provided by HS2 (LA05 Map Book CT-06-433) where this corridor is located and whether the requirement for a bridge to accommodate a future extension to the tram network has been factored in to the design. Reference to the tram extension to ‘the east of the station’ suggests that this is not the case. This would not allow for the Local Plan policy to be achieved and is a serious omission from the design of the station.

Greenwood Community Centre:

The WDES makes provision for the demolition of the Greenwood Community Centre in Toton as the land is potentially required during construction. As an important community asset in an area where the community will be affected by major local development this is not considered to be an appropriate course of action by HS2. Given that the temporary nature of the land use requirement and the community centres location at the edge of the potential area required during construction it is considered unnecessary to demolish the building and it is considered that an appropriate solution should be achieved to ensure the building can remain open or provide a new community centre, in advance of the closure of the Greenwood Community Centre, in an area within close proximity to the local Toton population.